
MINUTES

Meeting: **Planning Committee**

Date: Friday 8 November 2019 at 10.00 am

Venue: Board Room, Aldern House, Baslow Road, Bakewell

Chair: Mr R Helliwell

Present: Cllr D Birkinshaw, Cllr W Armitage, Cllr P Brady, Cllr M Chaplin, Cllr D Chapman, Cllr A Gregory, Cllr A Hart, Cllr I Huddleston, Cllr A McCloy, Cllr Mrs K Potter, Miss L Slack and Mr K Smith

Apologies for absence: Mr P Ancell and Cllr G D Wharmby.

148/19 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The minutes of the last meeting of the Planning Committee held on 11 October 2019 were approved as a correct record.

149/19 URGENT BUSINESS

The Chair welcomed Cllr Andrew Gregory who attended the meeting to observe as part of his planning training.

150/19 MEMBERS DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Item 6

It was noted that all Members had received an email from Ann Robinson and a letter from Peter Owens.

Mr Robert Helliwell declared a personal interest, as he knew Anne Robinson.

Cllr Kath Potter declared a personal interest as she was a member of CPRE who had commented on this item and she knew Anne Robinson. Cllr Kath Potter also knew the applicant's wife, as she had been a member of Rowsley Parish Council.

Cllr Patrick Brady declared a personal interest as his son-in-law's family live in Edensor.

Item 10

Cllr Andrew Hart declared a personal interest, as he knew Mr Peter Wilkinson who was a member of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council

Item 13

Cllr Patrick Brady had received an email from the applicant. Mr Robert Helliwell had received an email from the applicant's agent.

Item 14

It was noted that all Members had received emails from Mr T Hill and Mr G Brown

Item 16

It was noted that all Members had received an email from Mr R Webb

151/19 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Twelve members of the public were present to make representations to the Committee. Three members of the public attended to be available for questions if required.

152/19 MAJOR APPLICATION - IMPROVEMENTS AND EXPANSION OF THE EXISTING CAR PARK ASSOCIATED WITH CHATSWORTH HOUSE, TOGETHER WITH THE CREATION OF A NEW ACCESS ROAD VIA A SPUR OFF THE EXISTING A619/A621 ROUNDABOUT EAST OF BASLOW

It was noted that members had visited the site on the previous day.

The Planning Officer introduced the report and informed members that two letters of support for the application had been received after the completion of the committee report.

The Planning Officer asked for an amendment to be made to condition 3 of the report to include the word 'car'. Also an addition of a condition regarding the introduction of a new ticket office to ensure the design, size and materials were approved prior to commencement of the build.

The Planning Officer provided clarification regarding the number of trees to be removed from the car park. The tree survey stated that 35 trees would be removed but some immature trees that were close together had been counted as a group and therefore a total of 60 trees would be removed.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr Stephen Vickers, The Devonshire Group, supporter
- Anne Robinson, Friends of the Peak District, objector
- Dr Peter Owens, objector
- Dr Elise Percifull, Agent

The Planning Officer confirmed that the applicant had been working with the Authority's Transport Planner and that work was ongoing on a Travel Plan for the development which, if approved, would be submitted and approved prior to the commencement of the work as per condition 15 of the report.

Members requested that electric hook up points be added to the Travel Plan as part of the development for the charging of electric vehicles.

Members were concerned about the requested increase in the number of days that the ground in front of the Bastion Wall would be used for parking (as per condition 3 of the report) and would prefer that no parking take place in this area of the grounds beyond the 11 days set out in the report and conditions

Members were concerned that the proposal before them would encourage more car journeys and requested the submission of a detailed travel plan in advance of approval of the scheme.

A motion to defer the application for further discussion with the applicant on issues of concern including a more strategic look at transport and other options through the completion of a travel plan, a report on the impact and benefits on nearby communities of the proposed highway changes and the landscape impact of the changes to the grounds and the impact of the removal of trees. The motion to defer the application was moved and seconded. Members also requested clarification on where overspill parking would be if not between the Bastion Wall and the river.

The recommendation to defer the item for further discussion between Officers and the applicant and then return to committee was put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

To DEFER the application for further discussions between the applicant and Planning Officers on a strategic approach to transport and visitor management, the impact of the proposals on the historic parkland and landscape, particularly the impact of the removal of trees, and the impact and benefits of the proposals on local communities.

The meeting adjourned for a break at 11.30 and reconvened at 11.40.

153/19 FULL APPLICATION - CONSTRUCTION OF 9 RESIDENTIAL UNITS (USE CLASS C3), COMPRISING 2 NO. 1-BEDROOM FLATS; 2 NO. 2-BEDROOM DWELLINGS AND 2 NO. 3-BEDROOM DWELLINGS FOR AFFORDABLE RENT AND 3 NO. 3-BEDROOM DWELLINGS FOR SHARED OWNERSHIP, ASSOCIATED CAR PARKING, CREATION OF NEW ACCESS, LANDSCAPING AND ASSOCIATED WORKS AT LAND OFF CHURCH LANE, RAINOW

The Planning Officer introduced the report. A similar application was considered by Planning Committee in March 2019. The applicant had appealed the decision of the committee in March 2019.

The Planning Officer confirmed that a Tree Report had been received the day before, too late to obtain an update from the Peak District National Park Authority's Tree Officer.

The Officer recommendation to refuse the application was moved and seconded.

The objection from the Highways Authority had not been received in time to be included in the committee report but was added to the reasons for refusal.

A motion to refuse the application was put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

To REFUSE the application for the following reasons:

- 1. The submitted application does not demonstrate that the development would meet eligible local needs for affordable housing and therefore fails to demonstrate exceptional circumstances to allow new build housing within the National Park contrary to Core Strategy policy HC1, Development Management Policy DMH1 and the National Planning Policy Framework.**
- 2. By virtue of its scale, density, layout, materials and detailed design the proposed development would fail to reflect or respect the character of the local area and would harm the character and appearance of the area, the setting of the designated Rainow Conservation Area and the landscape character of the National Park contrary to Core Strategy policies GSP1, GSP3, L1 and L3, Development Management Policies DMC1, DMC3, DMC5, DMC8 and DMC13 and the National Planning Policy Framework.**
- 3. Insufficient information has been submitted to demonstrate that the development can be carried in a manner which avoids or mitigates the impact upon trees on site and local biodiversity. The proposal development is therefore contrary to Core Strategy policy GSP1 and L2, development management policies DMC11 and DMC13 and the National Planning Policy Framework.**
- 4. Insufficient information has been submitted with the application to demonstrate that the development would achieve the highest possible standards of carbon reductions and water efficiency in order to mitigate the causes of climate change contrary to Core Strategy Policy CC1 the Authority's adopted Supplementary Planning Document 'Climate Change and Sustainable Building' and the National Planning Policy Framework.**
- 5. The location of the access road results in an unsafe access from the site on to the public highway.**

154/19 FULL APPLICATION - 2 LOCAL NEED AFFORDABLE HOUSES, LAND ADJACENT TO HILLSIDE BUNGALOW, SCHOOL LANE, TADDINGTON

Item withdrawn prior to meeting.

155/19 FULL APPLICATION - PROPOSED ERECTION OF 2 NO. LOCAL NEED AFFORDABLE DWELLINGS AT LAND ADJACENT TO MAIN ROAD, NETHER PADLEY, GRINDLEFORD

The Planning Office introduced the report and asked for an additional point to be added to the reasons for refusal as the calculation of the internal area of the properties had not taken account of the area of the garage which increased the floor size of each dwelling beyond the maximum floorspace allowable for affordable dwellings in the Development Management Policies.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr Peter O'Brien, objector
- Mr Finch, applicant

The Officer recommendation to refuse the application was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

To REFUSE the application for the following reasons:

- 1. The proposal is for two Local Needs Affordable dwellings on an undeveloped 'rural exception' site. No Parish Needs Survey has been provided for Grindleford Parish so the level, size and type of housing cannot be proven to be meeting an eligible or essential need for local needs affordable housing for the community. The proposal is therefore contrary to Core Strategy policy HC1 and Development Management Policy DMH1 and the NPPF (para 77).**
- 2. There is no evidence that there is an essential need to provide care that can only be provided through the development of two new local needs affordable homes. Care could feasibly be delivered in a different way and it is not considered that there is an essential need demonstrated for two people (carers) to live close to the infirm family member. The proposed occupants do not meet the occupancy criteria for the proposed 2 new dwellings and therefore the proposal is contrary to DMH2 and the NPPF.**
- 3. The applicants/proposed occupants of the 2 proposed Local Needs Affordable Homes already live relatively close to the infirm relative so the essential need to provide care from the site proposed is not demonstrated. The applicants are not considered to be in need or meet the first occupancy criteria for new Local Needs Affordable Housing. The proposal is therefore contrary to DMH2 and the NPPF.**
- 4. The floorspace of the properties exceeded that allowed for affordable housing.**

156/19 FULL APPLICATION - PROPOSED NEW MENAGE ARENA AND AGRICULTURAL BUILDING IN EXISTING PADDOCK FIELD AT HARVEY GATE FARM, BLAKELOW ROAD, ONECOTE

It was noted that members had visited the site on the previous day.

The Planning Officer introduced the report.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr Peter Wilkinson, supporter
- Ms Weaver, applicant

A motion to continue the meeting beyond three hours was put to the vote and carried.

The applicant confirmed that the extended apron would be made of hardstanding and not concrete as stated by the Planning Officer.

Members felt that the impact of the proposal on the landscape was not significant enough to refuse the application.

Contrary to the Officer recommendation a motion to approve the application subject to conditions, was proposed, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

To APPROVE the application subject to conditions to control the following matters:

- 1. Re-location of building to north eastern boundary**
- 2. Time limit for commencement**
- 3. Development to be carried out in accordance with amended plans.**
- 4. Restricted to private use only.**
- 5. Scheme of planting to be approved prior to completion.**
- 6. Consultation and agreement with officers of surface material for ménage**
- 7. No external lighting permitted**
- 8. Design details, including colour of external walls of shed to be approved prior to commencement of development.**
- 9. Work to commence within three years of approval.**

The meeting was adjourned at 13.15 for a lunch break and reconvened at 13.40

157/19 FULL APPLICATION - ALTERATIONS AND CHANGE OF USE OF TRADITIONAL RURAL BUILDING TO FORM 3 HOLIDAY LETS AT THE HOMESTEAD, MAIN STREET, BIGGIN

The Planning officer introduced the report and asked for it to be noted that there was an error in paragraph 64 of the report which should say 'The application is recommended for approval'. The Officer also requested that a condition stating that archaeological recording take place prior to commencement of work commencing be added.

The following spoke under the Public Participation at Meetings Scheme:

- Mr Peter Frampton – agent

A motion to approve the application subject to changes to the conditions was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

To APPROVE the application subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Time limit for commencement.**
- 2. Development to be carried out in accordance with the amended plans.**
- 3. Use restricted to short-term holiday let only.**

4. Removal of permitted development rights for extensions and alterations.
5. Control of the extent of residential curtilage.
6. Window and doors to be timber with details to be approved.
7. Building to be converted within its shell and with no rebuilding other than a replacement roof on the single storey element.
8. Boundary treatments to be approved.
9. Bat mitigation measures to be implemented.
10. Scheme of carbon reduction and energy efficiency measures to be approved and then implemented.
11. A scheme of archaeological building recording is completed prior to the commencement of work.
12. A lighting scheme to be approved.

158/19 SECTION 73 APPLICATION - REMOVAL OF CONDITION 58 ON NP/DDD/0815/0779 FOR DEMOLITION OF EXISTING INDUSTRIAL BUILDINGS, DEVELOPMENT OF 55 DWELLINGS (C3), ERECTION OF 6 INDUSTRIAL STARTER UNITS (B1), CAR PARKING, LANDSCAPING AND DRAINAGE ATTENUATION WITH ACCESS FROM NETHERSIDE (STARTER UNITS) AND BRADWELL HEAD ROAD (RESIDENTIAL), AT FORMER NEWBURGH ENGINEERING CO LTD, NEWBURGH WORKS, BRADWELL

Item withdrawn prior to meeting.

159/19 DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE

The Chair brought forward item 18 as the speakers had not arrived for the next item.

The Head of Development Management introduced the report.

The report was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

The report was noted.

160/19 HEAD OF LAW REPORT - PLANNING APPEALS

The Chair brought forward item 19 as the speakers had not arrived for the next item.

The Head of Development Management introduced the report and provided an update on the recent prosecution in relation to work carried out on a Grade II listed building without permission.

Members thanked the Legal and Enforcement Teams for the work that had led to a successful prosecution.

The report was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

The report was noted.

161/19 FULL APPLICATION - PROPOSED ANCILLARY BUILDING TO SERVE AS STORAGE (INCLUDING BICYCLES AND TOOLS) AND AS A GENERAL MULTI-PURPOSE ROOM AT GABLED HOUSE, SOUTH CHURCH STREET, BAKEWELL

The Chair brought forward item 14 as the speakers had not arrived for the next item.

The Planning Officer introduced the report. The information requested at the Planning Committee in June 2019 had been provided

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Garrie Smith – Objector
- Tim Hill - Objector

A motion to approve the application was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

To APPROVE the application subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Standard 3 year time limit**
- 2. Amended plans and details**
- 3. Design and materials**
- 4. Outbuilding to remain ancillary to main dwelling**
- 5. The building shall not be set on the concrete pads until a scheme is provided to the planning authority and approved by the planning authority setting out how the building will incorporate measures to address climate change and sustainability.**

162/19 FULL APPLICATION - CONVERSION OF EXISTING BUILDING WITHIN THE CURTILAGE OF A DWELLING HOUSE TO FORM LIVING ACCOMMODATION FOR ANCILLARY USE OF THE MAIN DWELLING - RETAINING 1 STABLE, EQUIPMENT STORE AND TACK ROOM WITHIN THE APPLICATION BUILDING - LANE FARM, BAR ROAD, CURBAR

The Planning Officer introduced the report which had been deferred from the September Committee. Assurance that had been requested had been received.

A motion to approve the application was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

To **APPROVE** the application subject to the following conditions:

1. **3 year implementation period.**
2. **Development to be carried out in accordance with specified amended plans.**
3. **Ancillary domestic use only and tied to Lane Farm.**
4. **No use of the building for holiday or other letting.**
5. **Tack room, equipment store and stable for equestrian use only.**
6. **New door to be in timber and recessed to match.**
7. **Permitted Development Rights removed.**
8. **Area shown for parking, garaging, circulation and standing of vehicles being provided prior to use**

Cllr David Chapman left the meeting at 14.40

163/19 FULL APPLICATION - DEMOLITION OF EXISTING GARAGE AND ERECTION OF DOUBLE GARAGE WITH STORE AT PEAR TREE COTTAGE, MAIN STREET, CALVER, S32 3XR

It was noted that members had visited the site on the previous day.

The Planning Officer introduced the report.

A motion to approve the application was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

The Officer confirmed that condition 13 would be amended to include details of timing and an additional condition would be added to cover lighting.

RESOLVED:

To **APPROVE** the application subject to the following conditions:

1. **3 year implementation period.**
2. **Development to be carried out in accordance with specified amended plans.**
3. **First floor to be ancillary domestic storage use only and not to be rented out.**
4. **Limestone walls to match adjacent stable block.**
5. **Blue slate roof to match adjacent stable block.**

6. **Timber windows, doors and timber vertically boarded garage doors.**
7. **Windows and doors recessed.**
8. **Conservation rooflights flush with roof.**
9. **Black metal balustrade to staircase.**
10. **Natural stone lintels and sills.**
11. **Ground floor garage area for parking of vehicles only**
12. **Permitted development rights removed.**
13. **A scheme shall be provided to set out measures proposed to address policy CC1.**
14. **A scheme shall be provided regarding any proposed external lighting of the site.**

164/19 FULL APPLICATION - LISTED BUILDING CONSENT FOR REPLACEMENT WINDOWS IN THE NORTH AND SOUTH ELEVATIONS AT MANOR FARM, OLDFIELDS FARM LANE, GRINDON

The Planning Officer introduced the report.

The following spoke under the Public Participation at Meetings Scheme:

- Mr James Goodfield – applicant

Members felt that the application was close to approval but more discussions were needed between the applicant and Planning Officer in order to achieve an acceptable amended scheme. Members requested the item be deferred for further discussions. A motion to defer the item, contrary to Officer recommendation was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

To DEFER the item for further discussion in order to achieve an acceptable amended scheme and to delegate the decision to the Director of Conservation and Planning

165/19 FULL APPLICATION - CHANGE OF USE OF AGRICULTURAL BARN TO 3 NO. LETTING ROOMS (NP/DDD/0519/0462 TS) AND SECTION 73 APPLICATION - VARIATION OF CONDITION 1 ON NP/DDD/1117/1128 TO ALLOW THE APPROVED STABLES AND TACK ROOM TO BE USED AS ANCILLARY DOMESTIC ACCOMMODATION AT BLEAKLOW FARM, BRAMLEY LANE, HASSOP

The Planning Officer introduced the report which was to seek Members views on how to respond to two appeals relating to this application.

The Officer Recommendation as set out in the report was moved and seconded.

Members requested a condition be recommended to the Planning Inspector in the event the appeals are allowed, relating to the prevention of the additional accommodation being used as holiday lets.

The Officer recommendation as set out in the report was put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the Authority adopts the following grounds for defending the appeals in respect of applications NP/DDD/0519/0462 and NP/DDD/0519/0460:

- 1. The applicant has submitted two applications to the Authority for developments which increase the number of rooms at Bleaklow Farm, including some which are explicitly for letting accommodation. When taken together with approved developments on the site and with other development that the applicant has undertaken without planning permission, notably extension of the curtilage to provide a substantial car parking area, a new vehicular access, and internal works to an existing agricultural building, the Authority has concerns about the cumulative impact of the development. These concerns relate to the potential for materially greater traffic movements to the site, with a consequential adverse impact on the quiet enjoyment and amenity of users of the surrounding highway network and on the amenity of the residents of the hamlet of Rowland. This would be contrary to Core Strategy policies GSP1, GSP2 and GSP3 and Development Management DPD policies DMC3 and DMT5.**
- 2. In response to these concerns, the Authority deferred consideration of the planning applications to seek clarification from the applicant but no additional information has been submitted. In the absence of this information the Authority has been unable to fully assess the potential impacts of the developments.**

The meeting ended at 3.30 pm